LAW OFFICES

BEVERIDGE & DIAMOND, P. C.

SUITE 700 1350 I STREET, N. W. Washington, D. C. 20005-3311

(202) 789-6000

TELECOPIER (202) 789-6190

40TH FLOOR 437 MADISON AVENUE NEW YORK, N. Y. 10022-7380 (212) 702-5400

BEVERIDGE & DIAMOND SUITE 400 ONE BRIDGE PLAZA FORT LEE, N. J. 07024-7502 (201) 585-8162

BEVERIDGE & DIAMOND SUITE 3400 ONE SANSOME STREET SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94104-4438 (415) 397-0100

September 15, 1997

Sherry Estes, Esq. Office of Regional Counsel U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region V 77 W. Jackson Boulevard (C-29A) Chicago, IL 60604

EPA Region 5 Records Ctr.

Re:

Plaintiffs' First Amendment Complaint in Dow Chemical Company, et al. v. Acme

Wrecking, et al. (CA No. C-1-97-0307/0308 S.D. Ohio)

Dear Sherry:

JAMES B. SLAUGHTER (202) 789-6040

JSLAUGHTER@BDLAW.COM

Pursuant to your recent discussion with Karl Bourdeau, enclosed for your information and files is a copy of Plaintiffs' First Amendment Complaint, filed last Friday, September 12, 1997. As you know, the case management order providing for ADR at the Skinner Site granted Plaintiffs leave to add new Defendants to the case (and the ADR process) through September 12th.

Accordingly, the Plaintiffs have added as new Defendants the following seven entities: City of Fairfield, Johnston Coca-Cola Bottling Group, Monsanto Company, Ralcorp Holdings, Inc. (successor to Ralston Purina, which operated a pet food factory in Sharonville, Ohio), Sealy Incorporated (successor to Foster Sterns company, a bedding manufacturer), the United States Air Force (for activities related to the Wright-Patterson Air Base), and the United States Information Agency (for waste disposal related to the Voice of America transmitter facilities near the Skinner Site).

Please feel free to call me if you or your staff have questions regarding these PRPs.

Sincerely,

James R Slowaber

Enclosure

Karl Bourdeau, Esq. \CLI\17\21\4353\LTR\4353JBS.42

FILED

SEP 1 2 1997

KENNETH J. MURPHY, Clerk CINCINNATI, OHIO

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO WESTERN DIVISION AT CINCINNATI, OHIO

THE DOW CHEMICAL COMPANY Civil Action Nos. 1-97-0307 Civil Action Nos. 1-97-0308 2030 Dow Center (consolidated cases) Midland, MI 48674, and : FORD MOTOR COMPANY Park Lane Towers East Suite 728 FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT One Parklane Blvd. Dearborn, MI 48126, and GE AIRCRAFT ENGINES One Neuman Way MD T165A Cincinnati, OH 45215-6301, and MORTON INTERNATIONAL, INC. Morton International Building 100 North Riverside Plaza Randolph Street at the River Chicago, IL 60606-1596, and PPG INDUSTRIES, INC. One PPG Place 40 South Pittsburgh, PA 15272,

and

VELSICOL CHEMICAL CORPORATION 2603 Corporate Avenue	:
Suite 100 Memphis, TN 38132, Plaintiffs,	:
v .	:
ACME WRECKING CO., INC. 3111 Syracuse Street Cincinnati, OH 45206,	:
and	:
AERONCA, INC. 1712 Germantown Road Middletown, OH 45042-1716,	:
and	:
AMERICAN PREMIER UNDERWRITERS, INC. One East Fourth Street Cincinnati, OH 45202,	:
and	•
AMERICAN STANDARD, INC. 1466 Broadway	:
New York, NY 10036,	:
and	:
ANCHOR HOCKING CORPORATION P.O. Box 600 Lancaster, OH 43130-0600,	:
and	:
THE ANDREW JERGENS COMPANY 2535 Spring Grove Avenue Cincinnati, OH 45214-1773,	:
and	:

CANADIAN OXY OFFSHORE	;
PRODUCTION CO. c/o Glenn Springs Holdings, Inc.	i
P.O. Box 300	•
Tulsa, OK 74102,	
,	
and	:
OUAL OVOLUBEED NATIONAL	_
CHAMPION INTERNATIONAL CORPORATION	
One Champion Plaza	
Stamford, CT 06921,	•
,	;
and	
	:
CHEMICAL LEAMAN TANK LINES, INC.	
P.O. Box 10 Ross, OH 45061-0010,	:
Ross, OII 43001-0010,	•
and	•
	:
THE CINCINNATI ENQUIRER	
312 Elm Street	:
Cincinnati, OH 45202-2709,	
and	:
and	:
CLARKE CONTAINER, INC.	·
2040 East Kemper Rd.	:
Cincinnati, OH 45241-1804,	
	:
and	
CLARKE SANITARY LANDFILL	•
9740 Cincinnati-Dayton Rd.	:
West Chester, OH,	
	:
and	
DICK CLARKE TRASH REMOVAL AND	:
DEMOLITION	
9740 Cincinnati-Dayton Rd.	•
West Chester, OH,	:
and	•

CLARKE'S COMPLETE COLLECTION 9740 Cincinnati-Dayton Rd. West Chester, OH, and CLARKE'S INCINERATORS, INC. 2040 East Kemper Rd. Cincinnati, OH 45241-1804, and CLARKE SERVICES, INC. 9740 Cincinnati-Dayton Rd. West Chester, OH, and CLERMONT WASTE COLLECTION INC. 640 Sonny Lane Cincinnati, OH 45244, and THE C.M. PAULA COMPANY 7773 School Road Cincinnati, OH 45249-1590, and : COLUMBIAN CHEMICALS COMPANY c/o Glenn Springs Holdings, Inc. P.O. Box 300 Tulsa, OK 74102, and CONSOLIDATED RAIL CORPORATION 2001 Market Street 16-A Two Commerce Square Philadelphia, PA 19101-1416, and

CYTEC INDUSTRIES, INC. Five Garret Mountain Plaza West Paterson, NJ 07424,	
and	
THE DAVID HIRSCHBERG STEEL COMPANY 211 Longworth Street Lockland, OH 45215,	
and	
CITY OF DEER PARK 4250 Matson Avenue Deer Park, OH 45236,	;
and	;
E.I. DU PONT DE NEMOURS AND COMPANY D8068 1007 Market Street Wilmington, DE 19898,	;
and	;
CITY OF FAIRFIELD C/O Mayor Robert J. Wolpert 5350 Pleasant Avenue Fairfield, OH 45014-3597,	
and	:
FORMICA CORPORATION 10155 Reading Road Cincinnati, OH 45241,	:
and	:
GENERAL MOTORS CORPORATION 3044 W. Grand Boulevard	:
Room 12-149 Detroit, MI 48202, and	:

GEORGIA-PACIFIC CORPORATION 4710 Dues Drive
Cincinnati, OH 45246,
and
VILLAGE OF GLENDALE Office of the Mayor 30 Village Square Glendale, OH 45246,
and
GLENN SPRINGS HOLDINGS, INC. P.O. Box 300 Tulsa, OK 74102,
and
GLOBE VALVE COMPANY P.O. Box 278 Delphi, IN 46923,
and
HENKEL CORPORATION 2200 Renaissance Blvd. Gulph Mills, PA 19406,
and
HILTON DAVIS COMPANY 2235 Langdon Farm Road Cincinnati, OH 45237,
and
INTERNATIONAL PAPER CORPORATION, a/k/a MASONITE CORPORATION International Place I 6400 Poplar Avenue Memphis, TN 38197, and

JOHN F. BUSHELMAN CONSTRUCTION, INC 11980 Runyan Drive Cincinnati, OH 45241,	
and	
JOHNSTON COCA-COLA BOTTLING GROUP, INC. C/O Registered Agent CSC Lawyers Incorporating Service 16 East Broad Street Columbus, OH 43215,	
and	•
JOHN J. WHITTON TRUCKING CO. 1478 Fitzpatrick Street Price Hill, OH 45204,	
and	•
KING CONTAINER 7420 Jager Court Cincinnati, OH 45230,	:
and	:
KING CONTAINER SERVICES, INC. 2020 Stapleton Court Forest Park, OH 45240,	:
and	:
KING WRECKING	:
7420 Jager Court Cincinnati, OH 45230,	:
and	:
VILLAGE OF LINCOLN HEIGHTS 1201 Steffen Avenue	:
Lincoln Heights, OH 45215,	:
and	

LOCKHEED MARTIN CORPORATION 7921 Southpark Plaza Littleton, CO 80120, and : CITY OF MASON c/o Cincinnati Commerce Center 600 Vine Street Cincinnati, OH 45202-2409, and CITY OF MADIERA 7141 Miami Avenue Cincinnati, OH 45243-2699, and MECCO, INC. 211 N. University Boulevard Middletown, OH 45042, and MILLENNIUM PETROCHEMICALS, INC. 7002 N. State Route 123 Franklin, OH 45005, and MOBIL OIL CORP. 3225 Gallows Road, Room 4C912 Fairfax, VA 22037-0001, and MUNICIPALITY OF MONROE 201 S. Main Street Monroe, OH 45050, and

MONSANTO COMPANY : C/O Registered Agent C.T. Corporation System : 815 Superior Ave., N.E. Cleveland, OH 44114, and CITY OF MONTGOMERY 10101 Montgomery Road Montgomery, OH 45242, and MVM, INC. 11997 Runyan Drive Sharonville, OH 45241, and NEWELL CO. 4000 Auburn Street Rockford, IL 61101, and NEWBERRY CONSTRUCTION COMPANY 10070 Windisch Road West Chester, OH 45069, : and : OXY, USA, INC. c/o Glenn Springs Holdings, Inc. P.O. Box 300 : Tulsa, OK 74102, and THE PROCTER AND GAMBLE CO. One Procter & Gamble Plaza Cincinnati, OH 45201, and :

QUANTUM CHEMICAL CORPORATION, F/K/A NATIONAL DISTILLERS &	:
CHEMICALS CORP.	;
P.O. Box 429549	
Cincinnati, OH 45249,	;
and	:
QUEEN CITY BARREL COMPANY 1937 South Street	:
Price Hill, OH 45204,	:
and	:
RALCORP HOLDINGS, INC. C/O Registered Agent	:
C.T. Corporation System 815 Superior Avenue, N.E.	:
Cleveland, OH 44114,	:
and	:
CITY OF READING 1000 Market Street	:
Reading, OH 45215,	:
and	:
RUMPKE SANITARY LANDFILL 3882 Stuble Road	:
Groesbeck, OH 45251,	:
and	:
RUMPKE WASTE COLLECTION & DISPOSAL SYSTEMS	:
10795 Hughes Road Cincinnati, OH 45251,	:
and	:
RUMPKE COLLECTION & DISPOSAL	:
SYSTEM 10705 Hughes Pond	:
10795 Hughes Road Cincinnati, OH 45251,	
Continuent, CII ISBSI,	•

and
SEALY, INC. C/O Registered Agent C.T. Corporation System 815 Superior Avenue, N.E. Cleveland, OH 44114,
and
SHELL OIL CO. 910 Louisiana One Shell Plaza, 47th Fl. Houston, TX 77002,
and
CITY OF SHARONVILLE 10900 Reading Road Sharonville, OH 45241,
and
SHELL CHEMICAL CO. 910 Louisiana One Shell Plaza, 47th Fl. Houston, TX 77002,
and
CITY OF SILVERTON 6860 Plainfield Road Silverton, OH 45236-4095,
and
ELSA SKINNER-MORGAN 8750 Cincinnati-Dayton Road West Chester, OH 45069, and
STEELCRAFT MANUFACTURING COMPANY 9017 Blue Ash Road Cincinnati, OH 45242-6825,

and	:
SUN OIL COMPANY d/b/a SUNOCO OIL CORP.	;
Legal, 17th Floor 1801 Market St. Philadelphia, PA 19103,	:
and	:
TEXACO, INC. 1111 Bagby Houston, TX 77210,	:
and	:
UNION CARBIDE CORP. 1290 Hercules	:
Suite 202 Houston, TX 77058,	:
and	:
UNITED STATES AIR FORCE Department of the Air Force	:
1670 Air Force Pentagon Washington, D.C. 20330-1678,	:
and	:
UNITED STATES INFORMATION AGENCY 301 Fourth Street, S.W.	:
Washington, D.C. 20547,	:
and	:
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA 10th St. & Constitution Ave., NW Workington, D.C., 20520	:
Washington, D.C. 20530, and	:

THE UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT : OF DEFENSE 3E880 The Pentagon Washington, D.C. 20301, and WILLIAM S. COHEN, IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS SECRETARY OF THE UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF **DEFENSE** 3E880 The Pentagon Washington, D.C. 20301, and THE UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE ARMY 104 Army Pentagon Washington, D.C. 20310, and WATSON'S/J&J DISTRIBUTING CO. c/o Corporate Statutory Services, Inc. Cincinnati, OH 45202, and TOGO D. WEST, JR., IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS SECRETARY OF THE ARMY 104 Army Pentagon Washington, D.C. 20310, Defendants.

FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT

Plaintiffs, The Dow Chemical Company, Ford Motor Company, GE Aircraft Engines, Morton International, Inc., PPG Industries, Inc., and Velsicol Chemical Corporation, through their undersigned counsel, hereby allege:

PRELIMINARY STATEMENT

Plaintiffs' First Amended Complaint is filed pursuant to the leave granted Plaintiffs to add additional parties under paragraph 27 of the First Case Management Order of August 27, 1997 ("CMO"). By Order of June 3, 1997, the Court stayed the requirement of answering or otherwise responding to the original Complaint under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 12. Paragraph 2 of the CMO of August 27th stayed the litigation altogether, including the requirement of answering or otherwise responding under Rule 12 to this First Amended Complaint, and directed all parties to participate in the Alternate Dispute Resolution ("ADR") process set forth in the CMO to attempt to settle disputed factual and legal issues at the Skinner Landfill Site. The new Defendants added in this First Amended Complaint are: City of Fairfield, Johnston Coca-Cola Bottling Group, Inc., Monsanto Company, Ralcorp Holdings, Inc., Sealy, Inc., United States Air Force and United States Information Agency.

INTRODUCTION

- 1. This action, which seeks relief with regard to a former landfill known as the Skinner Landfill, is brought pursuant to §§ 107 and 113 of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation and Liability Act of 1980 ("CERCLA"), 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607, 9613. The new Defendants added in this First Amended Complaint are City of Fairfield, Johnston Coca-Cola Bottling Group, Inc., Monsanto Company, Ralcorp Holdings, Inc., Sealy, Inc., United States Air Force, and the United States Information Agency.
- The Skinner Landfill Site (the "Site") is located in West Chester, an unincorporated area in Section 22 of Union Township, Butler County, Ohio. The Site, which occupies approximately 78 acres off the Cincinnati-Dayton Road, was operated from approximately 1934 to 1990 for the landfilling of a wide variety of materials. Materials deposited at the Site include demolition debris,

household and other municipal refuse, and a wide variety of chemical wastes, including paint wastes, ink wastes, creosote, pesticides, and other chemical wastes.

- 3. The United States Environmental Protection Agency ("EPA") placed the Site on the National Priorities List ("NPL") in September 1983 by publication in the Federal Register.
- 4. EPA subsequently performed a Phase I and Phase II Remedial Investigation to analyze the Site groundwater, surface water, soils and sediments. That investigation revealed the presence of numerous "hazardous substances," as that term is defined in §§ 101(14) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(14), at the Site.
- In April 1992, EPA made a Proposed Plan for remedial action at the Site available for public comment. Based on comments received at public meetings, EPA proposed implementing the first phase of the remedy, or an Interim Action Operable Unit ("Interim OU"). The Record of Decision ("ROD") for this Interim OU was signed by the Regional Administrator for EPA Region V on September 30, 1992. The Interim OU called for Site fencing, provision of an alternative water supply to potentially affected Site neighbors, and groundwater monitoring.
- 6. EPA issued a Unilateral Administrative Order ("UAO") in December 1992 to a group of potentially responsible parties ("PRPs"), including all the Plaintiffs to this action, to perform the actions set forth in the 1992 ROD. Pursuant to the UAO, a group of PRPs, including all the Plaintiffs to this action, performed the actions set forth in the 1992 ROD.
- 7. EPA then issued a ROD for the second and final phase of the remedy, or Operable Unit 2 ("OU2"), on June 4, 1993.
- 8. On March 29, 1994, a group of PRPs, including all the Plaintiffs to this action, signed an Administrative Order on Consent for Remedial Design, in which the PRPs agreed to fund all work

necessary to prepare a complete remedial design for the Site consistent with the remedy selected for OU2.

- 9. Certain PRPs, including all the Plaintiffs to this action, agreed among themselves to function as an organized entity called the Skinner Landfill PRP Group for the purpose of implementing the Administrative Order on Consent for Remedial Design.
 - The Remedial Design pursuant to the OU2 ROD was completed in June of 1996.

JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action and over the parties pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331, 1367, and 2201, and §§ 107 and 113 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607(a) and 9613(b).
- Venue is proper in this district and division pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1391(b) and (c), and §§ 107 and 113 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607 and 9613(b), because the releases or threatened releases of hazardous substances that give rise to these claims occurred in this district and division, because the real property which is the subject of this action is located within this district and division, and because a substantial part of the events, acts or omissions giving rise to these claims occurred within this district and division.
- This Court has pendent jurisdiction over Plaintiffs' common law claims for equitable restitution and equitable contribution.

PARTIES

14. Plaintiffs, The Dow Chemical Company, Ford Motor Company, GE Aircraft Engines, Morton International, Inc., PPG Industries, Inc. and Velsicol Chemical Corporation, are each a "person" as defined under § 101(21) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(21).

- Defendants are either individuals, corporations, or unincorporated businesses organized under the laws of the State of Ohio or the laws of a foreign state, municipal governments, or federal entities.
- Each of the Defendants is a "person" as defined by § 101(21) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(21).
- 17. Each of the Defendants is a person, or a successor-in-interest thereto, who arranged for the transport, disposal, or treatment of its waste, which waste was disposed of at the Site, or transported waste to the Site. Defendant Elsa Skinner is also the present owner and a former operator of the Site.

CLAIMS FOR RELIEF

COUNT I: CERCLA § 107 COST RECOVERY

- 18. Plaintiffs incorporate herein all of the allegations set forth above as if fully restated here.
- 19. Defendants are each "persons" within the meaning of § 101(21) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(21).
- 20. The Site was at all relevant times hereto a "facility" within the meaning of § 101(9) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(9).
- Upon information and belief, materials used, handled, stored and disposed of at, and/or transported to, the Site, were or contained "hazardous substances" as defined in § 101(14) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(14).
- 22. A "release" or "threatened release" of hazardous substances from the Site has occurred and continues to occur, and at all times relevant hereto was occurring, within the meaning of § 101(22) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(22).

- Upon information and belief, each Defendant or a predecessor-in-interest thereto, disposed, arranged for disposal or treatment, transported, accepted for transport, or arranged for the transport for disposal or treatment at the Site of "hazardous substances," within the meaning of § 101(14) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(14).
- 24. Defendant Elsa Skinner is the "owner" of the Site and "owned and operated" the Site at the time of disposal of hazardous substances there, within the meaning of § 101(20)(A) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(20)(A).
- 25. Plaintiffs have incurred costs in excess of \$2 million, and continue to incur costs, in connection with actions taken in "response" to the release or threatened release of hazardous substances at the Site, within the meaning of § 101(25) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9601(25), including, but not limited to, the costs of implementing the Unilateral Administrative Order, the Administrative Order On Consent for Remedial Design, and other administrative costs.
- Plaintiffs' actions taken at the Site and the response costs incurred or to be incurred incident thereto, were necessary and undertaken in a manner consistent with the National Contingency Plan, which is promulgated pursuant to § 105(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9605(a), and is codified at 40 C.F.R. Part 300 et seq.
- Plaintiffs have satisfied any and all conditions precedent to the undertaking of response actions, the incurrence of response costs, and the recovery of those costs under § 107(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a).
- 28. Pursuant to § 107(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a), Defendants are liable, jointly and severally, to Plaintiffs for all past, present and future response costs, including costs and prejudgment interest, incurred by Plaintiffs at the Site.

COUNT II: CERCLA § 113 CONTRIBUTION

- 29. Plaintiffs incorporate herein all of the allegations set forth above as if fully restated here.
- 30. Any person who has or will incur response costs may seek contribution from any other person who is liable or potentially liable under § 107(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a).
- 31. Defendants are strictly liable for response costs at the Site under § 107(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a).
- Plaintiffs are entitled to contribution from Defendants under § 113(f) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(f), for each Defendant's equitable share of all past and future response costs and damages incurred by Plaintiffs and for the response actions associated with the Site.

COUNT III: DECLARATORY RELIEF

- Plaintiffs incorporate herein all of the allegations set forth above as if fully restated here
- An actual, substantial, and justiciable controversy exists between Defendants and Plaintiffs regarding their respective rights and obligations for the response costs that have been and will be incurred in connection with the release and/or threatened release of hazardous substances at the Site.
- 35. Plaintiffs seek a declaratory judgment against Defendants under § 113(g)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(g)(2), holding Defendants jointly and severally liable for response costs incurred and to be incurred by Plaintiffs at the Site that will be binding in any subsequent action to recover further response costs or damages.
- Pursuant to § 113(g)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(g)(2), and 28 U.S.C. § 2201, Plaintiffs are entitled to a declaration from this court that Defendants are liable to Plaintiffs, jointly

and severally, for all, or Defendants' equitable share of, the response costs and damages incurred or to be incurred by Plaintiffs at the Site.

COUNT IV: EQUITABLE RESTITUTION

- Plaintiffs incorporate herein all of the averments set forth above as if fully restated here.
- 38. To date, Plaintiffs have incurred response costs, including but not limited to the costs of implementing the Unilateral Administrative Order and the Administrative Order on Consent for Remedial Design, and other expenses, including, but not limited to attorneys' fees, experts' fees and administrative costs, of over \$2 million.
- 39. By expending over \$2 million for these activities, Plaintiffs unofficiously conferred a benefit upon Defendants in the amount of at least \$2 million.
- 40. Retention by Defendants of this benefit in excess of \$2 million would be contrary to fundamental principles of justice and equity and would unjustly enrich Defendants.
- Plaintiffs are entitled to a judgment against Defendants for equitable restitution in the amount of each Defendant's equitable portion of the over \$2 million in incurred costs.

COUNT V: EQUITABLE CONTRIBUTION

- 42. Plaintiffs incorporate herein all of the averments set forth above as if fully restated here.
- The obligation to expend at least \$2 million in costs and expenses associated with the Site, and to continue to expend money to respond to contamination at the Site is a common legal obligation owed by Plaintiffs and Defendants.
- 44. Defendants have failed and continue to fail to contribute their equitable portion of the costs and expenses paid and to be paid by Plaintiffs.

- Defendants have breached their obligations with respect to the Site and are liable to Plaintiffs to pay their pro rata share of the resulting liability.
- 46. Consistent with fundamental principles of justice and equity, Plaintiffs have a right of contribution, arising under state common law and/or statutory law.
- Plaintiffs are entitled to contribution from Defendants in the amount of each Defendant's equitable portion of the costs incurred and to be incurred by Plaintiffs at the Site.

PRAYER FOR RELIEF

WHEREFORE, Plaintiffs request that this Court:

- A. Enter a judgment against Defendants that Defendants are jointly and severally liable under § 107 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607, for all response costs and damages Plaintiffs have incurred in connection with the release and/or threatened release of hazardous substances at, onto, or from the Site in an amount according to the proof at trial, plus attorney's fees, costs, and prejudgment interest;
- B. In the alternative, enter a judgment against Defendants, pursuant to § 113(f) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(f), for their fair, equitable, and proportionate contribution for all response costs and damages that Plaintiffs have incurred in connection with the release and/or threatened release of hazardous substances at, onto, or from the Site in an amount according to the proof at trial, plus attorney's fees, costs, and prejudgment interest;
- C. Enter a declaratory judgment that Defendants are jointly and severally liable under § 107 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9607 and under 28 U.S.C. § 2201, for all future response costs and damages resulting from the release and/or threatened release of hazardous substances at, onto, or from the Site, including attorney's fees, costs and prejudgment interest;

D. In the alternative, enter a declaratory judgment against Defendants, pursuant to § 113(f) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(f) and 28 U.S.C. § 2201, for their fair, equitable and proportionate share of all future response costs and damages resulting from the release and/or threatened release of hazardous substances at, onto, or from the Site, including attorney's fees, costs and prejudgment interest;

E. Enter a judgment that Defendants are liable for equitable restitution in the amount of each Defendant's equitable portion of the response costs incurred by Plaintiffs at the Site.

F. Enter a judgment against Defendants for their equitable portion of the costs incurred and to be incurred by Plaintiffs at the Site.

G. Enter a judgment against Defendants for Plaintiffs' costs, attorney's fees, and interest, and such other and further relief as this Court may deem just and appropriate.

Respectfully submitted,

Roger J. Makley (0018702)

Trial Attorney

33 West First Street, Suite 600

Dayton, Ohio 45402

Telephone: (937) 223-8177

ATTORNEY FOR PLAINTIFFS

Of Counsel:

Karl S. Bourdeau Beveridge & Diamond, P.C. 1350 I Street, N.W. Suite 700 Washington, DC 20005 (202) 789-6019 (202) 789-6041

JURY DEMAND

Plaintiffs demand a trial by jury on all issues triable to a jury.

Respectfully submitted,

Roger J. Makley (0018702)

Trial Attorney

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a true copy of the foregoing was served by regular U.S. mail, postage prepaid, this 12th day of September, 1997, upon the following:

ACME WRECKING CO., INC. Charles M. Meyer, Esq. Mike Leik, Esq. SANTON & HUGHES 312 Walnut Street Suite 3100 Cincinnati, OH 45202

AERONICA, INC.
David E. Northrop, Esq.
Samuels and Northrop Company, L.P.A.
180 East Broad Street, Suite 816
Columbus, OH 43215

AMERICAN PREMIER UNDERWRITERS, INC.
Lois Godfrey-Wye, Esq.
WILLKIE, FARR & GALLAGHER
Three Lafayette Centre
1155 21st Street, NW, Suite 600
Washington, D.C. 20036-3384

AMERICAN STANDARD CO.
Russell S. Frye, Esq.
CHADBOURNE & PARKE LLP
1200 New Hampshire Avenue, N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20036

ANCHOR-HOCKING CORP.

Peter J. Schultz, Director Environmental Affairs 4000 Auburn Street Rockford, IL 61101

ANDREW JERGENS COMPANY
A. Christian Worrell III
GRAYDON, HEAD & RITCHEY
1900 Fifth Third Center
511 Walnut Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

AVON PRODUCTS, INC. Kevin N. McMurray, Esq. Frost & Jacobs 2500 PNC Center 201 E. Fifth Street Cincinnati, OH 45202

AVON PRODUCTS, INC.
Peter Wang, Esq.
Assistant General Counsel and Director
Avon Products, Inc.
1345 Avenue of the Americas
New York, NY 10105-0196

BF GOODRICH Kenneth W. Maher, Esq. Law Office of Kenneth W. Maher 8888 Keystone Crossing Suite 1300 Indianapolis, IN 46240

BFI
William G. Beck, Esq.
Jon Haden, Esq.
LATHROP & GAGE L.C.
Suite 2500, 2345 Grand Boulevard
Kansas City, MO 64108-2684

BORDEN, INC. Vincent B. Stamp, Esq. Dinsmore & Shohl 1900 Chemed Center, 255 E. Fifth St. Cincinnati, OH 45202-4797

BP OIL CO. Cheryl Foerstner, Esq. David L. Bell, Managing Counsel B.P. America, Inc. 200 Public Square, 11-C Cleveland, OH 44114

BUTLER COUNTY
Stephen N. Haughey, Esq.
FROST & JACOB
2500 PNC Center
201 E. Fifth Street
P.O. Box 5715
Cincinnati, OH 45202

C.M. PAULA COMPANY
Wijdan Jreisat
KATZ, TELLER, BRANT & HILD
2400 Chemed Center
255 East Fifth Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202-4724

CANADIAN OXY OFFSHORE PRODUCTION CO. Chris A. Paul, Esq. GARDERE & WYNNE, L.L.P. 100 West Fifth Street 200 One Oak Plaza Tulsa, OK 74103-4240

CELOTEX CORPORATION
Jeffrey Greenberg, Esq.
BUSH, ROSS, GARDNER, WARREN & RUDY
220 S. Franklin Street
Tampa, FL 33602

CHAMPION INTERNATIONAL
CORPORATION
Dustin P. Ordway
DICKINSON, WRIGHT, MOON, VAN
DUSEN & FREEMAN
200 Ottawa Avenue, N.W., Suite 900
Grand Rapids, MI 49503-2423

CHAMPION INTERNATIONAL
CORPORATION
Melinda S. Kemp
Environmental Projects Manager
Champion International Corporation
One Champion Plaza
Stamford, CT 06921

CHEMICAL LEAMAN TANK LINES Lois Godfrey-Wye, Esq. WILLKIE, FARR & GALLAGHER Three Lafayette Centre 1155 21st Street, NW, Suite 600 Washington, D.C. 20036-3384

CINCINNATI ENQUIRER
Chris Worrell III, Esq.
GRAYDON, HEAD & RITCHEY
1900 Fifth Third Center
511 Walnut Street
P.O. Box 6464
Cincinnati, OH 45202

CITY OF BLUE ASH
John Murdock, Esq.
MURDOCK & BECK
2211 Carew Tower
441 Vine Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202-2912

CITY OF DEER PARK
John Murdock, Esq.
MURDOCK & BECK
2211 Carew Tower
441 Vine Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202-2912

VILLAGE OF LINCOLN HEIGHTS
Matthew W. Fellerhoff, Esq.
MANLEY, BURKE, LIPTON & COOK
225 West Court Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

CITY OF MASON
Lisa M. Rammes, Esq.
Robert P. Malloy, Esq.
W. Kelly Lundrigan, Esq.
WOOD & LAMPING
Suite 2500, 600 Vine Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202-2409

CITY OF MADEIRA Lisa M. Rammes, Esq. Robert P. Malloy, Esq. W. Kelly Lundrigan, Esq. WOOD & LAMPING Suite 2500, 600 Vine Street Cincinnati, OH 45202-2409

CITY OF MADEIRA Robert Malloy City of Madeira 7141 Miami Avenue Cincinnati, OH 45243-2699 CITY OF READING
Michele M. Fleming, Esq.
Michael R. Barrett, Esq.
BARRETT & WEBER
Atlas Building
524 Walnut Street, Suite 400
Cincinnati, OH 45202

CITY OF SHARONVILLE Tom Keating, Esq. KEETING, RITCHIE & SWICK 8050 Hosbrook Cincinnati, OH 45236

CLARKE CONTAINER
Jeffrey J. Harmon, Esq.
David J. Schmitt, Esq.
CORS & BASSETT
1200 Carew Tower
441 Vine Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

CLARKE SANITARY LANDFILL
Jeffrey J. Harmon, Esq.
David J. Schmitt, Esq.
CORS & BASSETT
1200 Carew Tower
441 Vine Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

DICK CLARKE TRASH REMOVAL AND DEMOLITION
Jeffrey J. Harmon, Esq.
David J. Schmitt, Esq.
CORS & BASSETT
1200 Carew Tower
441 Vine Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

CLARKE'S COMPLETE COLLECTION
Jeffrey J. Harmon, Esq.
David J. Schmitt, Esq.
CORS & BASSETT
1200 Carew Tower, 441 Vine Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

CLARKE'S INCINERATORS, INC.

Jeffrey J. Harmon, Esq.
David J. Schmitt, Esq.
CORS & BASSETT
1200 Carew Tower
441 Vine Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

CLARKE SERVICES, INC.

Jeffrey J. Harmon, Esq. David J. Schmitt, Esq. CORS & BASSETT 1200 Carew Tower 441 Vine Street Cincinnati, OH 45202

CLERMONT WASTE COLLECTION

Kent W. Seifried POSTON, SEIFRIED & SCHLOEMER 500 Campbell Towers 403 York Street Newport, KY 41071

COLUMBIAN CHEMICALS COMPANY

Chris Paul, Esq.
GARDERE & WYNNE, LLP
200 Oneok Plaza
100 W. Fifth Street
Tulsa, OK 74103-4240

COLUMBIAN CHEMICALS COMPANY

Christine Polecardo-Rainey Glenn Springs Holdings, Inc. 110 W. 7th Street, Suite 1 Tulsa, OK 74119-1036

CONSOLIDATED RAIL CORPORATION

William J. Pinamont CONSOLIDATED RAIL CORPORATION 2001 Makert Street 16-A Two Commercial Square Philadephia, PA 19101-1416

CYTEC INDUSTRIES, INC.

Barbara Clay, Esq.
Legal Department
5 Garret Mountain Plaza
West Paterson, NJ 07424

E.I. DUPONT DE NEMOURS AND

COMPANY
Ross Austin, Esq.
DuPont Legal Department
D8068
1007 Market Street
Wilmington, DE 19898

ELSA SKINNER MORGAN

Timothy Evans, Esq. HOLBROOK & JONSON L.P.A. Holbrook & Jonson Building 315 S. Monument Ave. P.O. Box 687 Hamilton, OH 45013

FORMICA CORPORATION

Vincent B. Stamp, Esq.
DINSMORE & SHOHL
1900 Chemed Center
255 E. Fifth Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

FORMICA CORPORATION

Michael Steinberg, Esq. MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS 1800 M Street, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036

GEORGIA PACIFIC CORPORATION

W.C. Blanton, Esq.
Gary P. Gengel, Esq.
OPPENHEIMER, WOLFF & DONNELLY
Plaza VII Building, Suite 3400
45 South Seventh Street
Minneapolis, MN 55402-1609

GLENN SPRINGS HOLDINGS, INC. Chris Paul, Esq.
GARDERE & WYNNE, LLP
200 Oneok Plaza, 100 W. Fifth Street
Tulsa, OK 74103-4240

GLENN SPRINGS HOLDINGS, INC.

Christine Polecardo-Rainey Glenn Springs Holdings, Inc. 110 W. 7th Street, Suite 1 Tulsa, OK 74119-1036

GLOBE VALVE COMPANY

Terri Czajka, Esq.
Jodie L. Miner, Esq.
ICE, MILLER, DANADIO & RYAN
One American Square
P.O. Box 82001
Indianapolis, IN 46282

HENKEL CORPORATION

Juliette Richter, Assoc. General Counsel The Triad, Suite 200 2200 Renaissance Boulevard Gulph Mills, PA 19406

HILTON-DAVIS COMPANY
Stephen N. Haughey, Esq.
FROST & JACOB
2500 PNC Center, 201 E. Fifth Street
P.O. Box 5715
Cincinnati, OH 45202

THE DAVID HIRSCHBERG STEEL COMPANY

James P. Rolman, Plant Manager 211 Longworth Street Lockland, OH 45215

INTERNATIONAL PAPER CORP.

Eric G. Johannessen Counsel-Environment, Health & Safety On behalf of Masonite Corporation International Place I 6400 Poplar Avenue Memphis, TN 38197 JOHN F. BUSHELMAN CONSTRUCTION, INC.
JFB, Inc.
G. Robert Hines
1014 Vine Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

JOHN WHITTON TRUCKING COMPANY

Kevin J. Hopper Co., L.P.A. Southhampton Square 7420 Jager Court Cincinnati, OH 45230

KING CONTAINER

Kevin J. Hopper 7420 Jager Court Cincinnati, OH 45230

KING CONTAINER SERVICES

Terry W. Baer 2020 Stapleton Court Cincinnati, OH 45240

KING WRECKING Kevin J. Hopper 7420 Jager Court

Cincinnati, OH 45230

LOCKHEED-MARTIN CORP.
Stephen P. Samuels, Esq.
SAMUELS & NORTHROP CO., L.P.A.
180 E. Broad, Suite 816

Columbus, OH 43215

LOCKHEED-MARTIN CORP.

James J. DeNapoli, Assistant General Counsel LOCKHEED MARTIN CORPORATION 7921 Southpark Plaza, Suite 210 Littleton, CO 80120

MILLENNIUM PETROCHEMICAL INC.

David A. Copeland, Esq. Millennium Petrochemicals, Inc. 11500 Northlake Drive Cincinnati, OH 45249 MECCO David Morgan, President 2100 S. Main Street P.O. Box 368 Middletown, OH 45042

MVM, INC. Kevin Hopper 7420 Jager Court Cincinnati, OH 45230

NEWELL CO.
Peter J. Schultz, Director Environmental
Affairs
4000 Auburn Street
Rockford, IL 61101

NEWBERRY CONSTRUCTION
COMPANY
Chris Worrell, Esq.
GRAYDON, HEAD & RITCHEY
1900 Fifth Third Center
511 Walnut Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202-3157

OXY, USA, INC. Chris A. Paul, Esq. GARDERE & WYNNE, L.L.P. 100 West Fifth Street 200 One Oak Plaza Tulsa, OK 74103-4240

OXY, USA, INC. Christine Polecardo-Rainey Glenn Springs Holdings, Inc. P.O. Box 300 Tulsa, OK 74102

THE PROCTOR AND GAMBLE CO.
David E. Ross, Senior Counsel
One Proctor & Gamble Plaza
Cincinnati, OH 45202

QUANTUM CHEMICAL CORP.
David A. Copeland, Esq.
Millennium Petrochemicals, Inc.
11500 Northlake Drive
Cincinnati, OH 45249

QUEEN CITY BARREL Stephen N. Haughey, Esq. FROST & JACOBS 2500 PNC Center 201 E. Fifth Street P.O. Box 5715 Cincinnati, OH 45202

RUMPKE SANITARY LANDFILL
William A. Posey
KEATING, MUETHING & KLEKAMP,
P.L.L.
1800 Provident Tower
One East Fourth Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

RUMPKE WASTE COLLECTION &
DISPOSAL SYSTEMS
William A. Posey
KEATING, MUETHING & KLEKAMP,
P.L.L.
1800 Provident Tower
One East Fourth Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

RUMPKE COLLECTION & DISPOSAL SYSTEM William A. Posey KEATING, MUETHING & KLEKAMP 1800 Provident Tower, One East Fourth St. Cincinnati, OH 45202

SHELL OIL CO. William C. Lowery, Esq. 910 Louisiana, One Shell Plaza, 47th Floor P.O. Box 2463 (77002) Houston, TX 77252-2463 SHELL CHEMICAL CO. William C. Lowery, Esq. Legal Department 910 Louisiana One Shell Plaza, 47th Floor P.O. Box 2463 (77002) Houston, TX 77252-2463

STEELCRAFT MANUFACTURING, CO. Russell S. Frye, Esq. CHADBOURNE & PARKE LLP 1200 New Hampshire Avenue, N.W. Washington, D.C. 20036

TEXACO OIL COMPANY R. Scott McCay, Esq. P.O. Box 4596 1111 Bagby Houston, TX 77210

UNION CARBIDE CORP. Roger Florio, Esq. UNION CARBIDE CORP. 39 Old Ridgebury Road Danbury, CT 06817

UNION CARBIDE CORP.
William E. Coughlin, Esq.
Calfee, Halter & Griswald
1400 McDonald Investment Bldg.
800 Superior Avenue
Cleveland, Ohio 44114-2688

VILLAGE OF GLENDALE Stephen N. Haughey, Esq. FROST & JACOB 2500 PNC Center 201 E. Fifth Street, P.O. Box 5715 Cincinnati, OH 45202

VILLAGE OF MONROE K. Philip Callahan, Law Director 101 N. First Street Miamisburg, OH 45342 VILLAGE OF MONTGOMERY Stephen N. Haughey, Esq. FROST & JACOB 2500 PNC Center 201 E. Fifth Street P.O. Box 5715 Cincinnati, OH 45202

VILLAGE OF SILVERTON Tom Donnellon 9079 Montgomery Road Cincinnati, OH 45242

WATSON'S/J&J DISTRIBUTNG CO. Wijdan Jreisat, Esq. KATZ, TELLER, BRANT & HILD 2400 Chemed Center 255 East Fifth Street Cincinnati, OH 45202-4724

Sharon J. Zealey, U.S. Attorney by: Anthony W. Nyktas, Sr. Asst. U.S. Atty UNITED STATES OF AMERICA 220 Potter Stewart U.S. Courthouse 100 E. Fifth Street Cincinnati, OH 45202

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA Tom Lorenzen, Esq. U.S. Department of Justice Environmental and Natural Resources Division P.O. Box 23986 Washington, D.C. 20026-3986

Sharon J. Zealey, U.S. Attorney by: Anthony W. Nyktas, Sr. Asst. U.S. Atty UNITED STATES DEPT. OF THE ARMY 220 Potter Stewart U.S. Courthouse 100 E. Fifth Street Cincinnati, OH 45202 UNITED STATES DEPT. OF THE ARMY Major Michael A. Cortin U.S. Army Environmental Law Division U.S. Army Litigation Center 901 North Stuart Street, Suite 400 Arlington, VA 22203

Sharon J. Zealey, U.S. Attorney
by: Anthony W. Nyktas, Sr. Asst. U.S. Atty
TOGO D. WEST, JR., IN HIS OFFICIAL
CAPACITY AS SECRETARY OF THE
ARMY
220 Potter Stewart U.S. Courthouse
100 E. Fifth Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

TOGO D. WEST, JR., IN HIS OFFICIAL CAPACITY AS SECRETARY OF THE ARMY
Major Michael A. Cortin
U.S. Army Environmental Law Division

U.S. Army Litigation Center 901 North Stuart Street, Suite 400 Arlington, VA 22203

Sharon J. Zealey, U.S. Attorney by: Anthony W. Nyktas, Sr. Asst. U.S. Atty UNITED STATES DEPT. OF DEFENSE 220 Potter Stewart U.S. Courthouse 100 E. Fifth Street Cincinnati, OH 45202

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE Tom Lorenzen, Esq. U.S. Department of Justice Environmental and Natural Resources Division P.O. Box 23986 Washington, D.C. 20026-3986 Sharon J. Zealey, U.S. Attorney
by: Anthony W. Nyktas, Sr. Asst. U.S. Atty
WILLIAM S. COHEN, IN HIS OFFICIAL
CAPACITY AS SEC. OF THE DEPT. OF
DEFENSE
220 Potter Stewart U.S. Courthouse
100 E. Fifth Street
Cincinnati, OH 45202

CAPACITY AS SEC. OF THE DEPT. OF DEFENSE
Tom Lorenzen, Esq.
U.S. Department of Justice
Environmental and Natural Resources Division
P.O. Box 23986
Washington, D.C. 20026-3986

WILLIAM S. COHEN, IN HIS OFFICIAL

SUN OIL COMPANY dba SUNOCO OIL CORP.

Thomas J. Haines, Sr. Attorney Sun Company, Inc. (R&M) Legal 17th Floor 1801 Market Street Philadelphia, PA 19103

Mark Carlton, Esq. MOBIL OIL CORP. Room 4C912 3225 Gallows Road Fairfax, VA 22037

Linda L. Bentley, Legal Assistant GENERAL MOTORS CORPORATION Legal Staff 3044 West Grand Boulevard, Room 12-149 Detroit, MI 48202

oger J. Makle

ATTACHMENT A

SKINNER LANDFILL CHRONOLOGY

Date:	Event:
~ 1934	Property later acquired by Skinners commences landfill
	operations
1947	Albert and Elsa Skinner acquire property
1963	Butler County Board of Health approves Site as Sanitary
	Landfill
1960s / 1970s	Numerous complaints lodged about Skinner Site operations by
	neighbors
1976	OHEPA investigation - oil in lagoons; OHEPA eventually files
	suit against Skinners.
1978	John and Albert Skinner deposed in OHEPA lawsuit
April 1983	USEPA issues Responsible Party Search Report
September 1983	Site listed on NPL
June 1985	USEPA issues §107 letter and request for good faith offer to
	conduct RI/FS to: Aeronca, Chem Dyne, Cincinnati Fiberglass,
	Dow, Ford, General Cooperage, Globe Valve, Monsanto, Shell
	Oil, Velsicol, Maxwell Co., and Elsa Skinner
1985	USEPA conducts Phase 1 Remedial Investigation ("RI") -
	groundwater, surface water and soil sampling.
1989	USEPA initiates Phase II RI
August 1990	OHEPA orders Skinner Site closed to all landfilling activities
May 1991	Phase II RI completed
1991	USEPA issues initial round of §104(e) Requests for Information
June 1991	USEPA conducts administrative depositions of several
	witnesses: Ray Skinner, Elsa Skinner-Morgan, former Chemical
	Learnan tank cleaner, former Sanders Waste driver
April 1992	USEPA completes Feasibility Study ("FS")
Sept. 29, 1992	USEPA signs Interim Action Operable Unit Record of Decision
	("ROD") - calls for Site fencing, provision of alternate water
	supply to potentially affected Site neighbors and groundwater
	monitoring
December 15, 1992	USEPA issues Unilateral Administrative Order ("UAO") for
	Interim Remedial Measures ("IRM") work to Respondents: Dow
	Chemical, Morton International, Monsanto Co., GE Aircraft
	Engines, Ford Motor Co., Velsicol Chemical, PPG Industries,
	Formica Corp., Chemical Leaman, Aeronca, Canadian Oxy
	("Oxy"), Columbian Chemicals, American Cyanamid, Georgia-
	Pacific, Multi-Color Type, Elsa Skinner, Erving Paper Mills,
4.000	Sealed Air Corp
January 1993	Group of UAO Respondents agree to perform IRM: Dow
	Chemical, Morton International, Monsanto Co., GE Aircraft
	Engines, Ford Motor Co., Velsicol Chemical, PPG Industries,
	Formica Corp., Chemical Leaman, Aeronca

December 1996

April 1996

PRPs conducting IRM hire PRP investigation firm - Orion Jan. - Aug. 1993 Management International - to conduct PRP search. Orion conducts comprehensive records search and interviews in excess of 32 witnesses with knowledge re: Site and/or PRPs June 4, 1993 USEPA signs ROD for the second and final Site Operable Unit September 29, 1993 IRM completed Group of PRPs (Dow, Morton International, Monsanto, GE April 1994 Aircraft Engines, Ford, Velsicol Chemical and PPG Industries) signs Administrative Order on Consent for Remedial Design ("RD") with USEPA 1994 USEPA issues second round of §104(e) Requests for Information and continues PRP search, including interviews and administrative depositions. USEPA deposes / interviews, among others, a former Skinner Site contract employee, Dick Clark of Clarke's Complete Collection and other Clarke business entities, Chem-Dyne principle Bill Kovacs, various King Container drivers, Whitton Trucking Company drivers Fall 1996 Cooperating PRP Group completes RD

USEPA sends notice of ADR proceedings to PRPs

Packages contained alleged nexus information sent to PRPs